



Tobacco-Free Ohio

# Comparing Economic Studies of Toledo's Clean Indoor Air Act

A study by researchers at the University of Toledo, the Medical College of Ohio and the Hospital Council of Northwest Ohio shows that the clean indoor air ordinance in Toledo has not negatively impacted businesses in those cities. The study found the following:

1. There was no statistically significant economic impact on bars, restaurants and bowling alleys in Toledo and Bowling Green when compared with the control cities of Youngstown and Kent and the suburbs of Toledo, none of which had clean indoor air ordinances.
2. The financial outlook of bars in the Toledo suburbs of Maumee, Sylvania, and Perrysburg has remained the same. Therefore, there is no indication that bars in areas surrounding Toledo are gaining business as a result of the ordinance.
3. Researchers studied economic stress scores from a major business information firm. The scale rated the economic stress of businesses on a scale of one to five, with one being the least stress and five being the most. The study found that Toledo bars never had an economic stress score greater than 1.63, not the economic devastation that opponents are claiming. *Price, J., Dake, J., Butler, P., Ruma, J., Northwest Ohio Strategic Alliance for Tobacco Control. A Study of the Process and Impact of Northwest Ohio Clean Indoor Air Ordinances: Economic Risk Faced by Bars, Bowling Alleys, and Restaurants After Passage of Clean Indoor Air Acts, August 2004*

In contrast, a study by a certified public accountant and paid for by Citizens for Common Sense, the group opposing Toledo's Clean Indoor Air Act shows that bars have been negatively impacted. *Coon, R. Letter to Citizens for Common Sense, October 5, 2004*

A comparison of the quality and reliability of these studies shows that the Citizens for Common Sense study is of poor quality and is not statistically valid. On the other hand, the University of Toledo study used proven statistical methods and so can be relied upon to be accurate.

**University of Toledo  
Medical College of Ohio  
Northwest Ohio Hospital Association of Ohio  
Economic Impact Study**

1. Looked at the economic condition of all Toledo area restaurants and bars, a total of 476 businesses.
2. Used information from an unbiased well-respected business information firm.
3. Was performed by experienced researchers using proven, valid statistical methods.

**Citizens for Common Sense  
Economic Impact Study**

1. Sent surveys to a small, non-random sample of businesses. Only 26 businesses replied.
2. Asked for sales figures from business owners or their employees or vendors, notoriously inaccurate figures.
3. Was performed by an accountant who did not use valid statistical methods.

---

**Tobacco-Free Ohio (TFO)** is a statewide organization dedicated to reducing tobacco use among Ohioans. Specifically, TFO strives to eliminate individuals' exposure to the health hazards of secondhand smoke in public places. TFO is a collaborative effort between the American Cancer Society, American Heart Association, American Lung Association, and the Ohio Department of Health. TFO began in 1997 by working to develop and maintain local tobacco control coalitions and to provide youth tobacco prevention education. Toledo study comparison, October 2004